



UNIVERSITY OF  
**TORONTO**  
FACULTY OF LAW

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 06108118 8

## **THE CONSTITUTIONAL STATE**

**FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO  
SECOND TERM 2008**

**PROFESSOR LORRAINE E. WEINRIB**

DORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

JAN - 7 2008

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

**THE CONSTITUTIONAL STATE**

**FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO  
SECOND TERM 2008**

**PROFESSOR LORRAINE E. WEINRIB**

**THE MODERN CONSTITUTIONAL STATE**  
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**  
**UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO WINTER 2008**

**I. THE COMMON LAW CONSTITUTION**

**A. CONSTITUTIONALISM WITHOUT A CONSTITUTION**

|   |    |
|---|----|
| Note on Chief Justice Coke .....  | 1  |
| The <i>Somerset</i> case  |    |
| Harlow & Rawlings, <i>Pressure Through Law</i> , extract .....                      | 2  |
| <i>Somerset v. Stewart</i> , 1772.....  | 3  |
| Harlow & Rawlings, <i>Pressure Through Law</i> , extract .....                      | 6  |
| <i>Forbes v. Cochrane</i> , 1824 .....  | 7  |
| <i>Entick v. Carrington</i> , 1765 .....  | 9  |
| Allan, <i>Law Liberty and Justice</i> .....   | 11 |
| Craig, <i>Administrative Law</i> 5 ed., “Human Rights the Common Law Background” .. | 13 |

**II: CONSTITUTIONAL SUPREMACY**

**B. THE WRITTEN CONSTITUTION**

|  |    |
|--|----|
| <i>Marbury v Madison</i> , U.S. Supreme Court, 1803 .....                          | 22 |
| Kaplin, Historical Timeline for the Development of Federal Con Rights (U.S.) ..... | 23 |
| Farber et al, <i>Constitutional Law</i> , Note on <i>Dred Scott</i> .....          | 26 |
| <i>Plessy v. Ferguson</i> , U.S. Supreme Court, 1896 .....                         | 28 |
| New York Times, “A Hemings Family Turns from Black, to White, to Black” .....      | 34 |
| <i>Bradwell v. State</i> U.S. Sup Ct., 1873.....                                   | 35 |
| <i>Personnel Administrator v Feeney</i> , U.S. Sup Ct, 1979 .....                  | 37 |
| <i>Rostker v. Goldberg</i> , U.S. Supreme Ct, 1981.....                            | 39 |
| Canada: "race" cases, 1899 – 1914 .....  | 42 |

**C. . THE POLICE POWER**

|  |    |
|--|----|
| <i>Lochner v. New York</i> , U.S. Supreme Court, 1908 .....              | 45 |
| Henkin et al, <i>Human Rights</i> , “Limitations on Rights”, 194 ff..... | 52 |
| <i>Buck v Bell</i> , U.S. Supreme Court 1927.....                        | 60 |
| <i>West Coast Hotel v. Parrish</i> , U.S. Supreme Court, 1937.....       | 62 |
| <i>Homosexuality Case</i> , German Constitutional Court, 1957.....       | 64 |
| <i>Transsexual Case</i> , German Constitutional Court, 1979.....         | 69 |
| <i>Washington v Davis</i> , U.S. Supreme Court, 1976.....                | 70 |
| <i>McClesky v Kemp</i> U.S. Sup Ct 1987 .....                            | 72 |
| <i>Bowers v Hardwick</i> , U.S. Sup Ct 1986.....                         | 78 |
| <i>Michael H v. Gerald D</i> , U.S. Supreme Court 1989.....              | 85 |

### **III. THE MODERN CONSTITUTIONAL STATE**

#### **D. OLD CONSTITUTIONS TRANSFORMED: IMPLIED OR STRUCTURAL RIGHTS**

##### United States Supreme Court:

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Michael Klarman, "Race and Rights", extracts .....   | 88  |
| O'Brien, Constitutional Law & Politics, <i>Brown v. Board of Education</i><br>{introduction} .....   | 91  |
| <i>Brown v. Board of Education</i> , U.S. Supreme Court, 1954.....                                   | 96  |
| <i>Poe v. Ullman</i> , U.S. Sup Ct, 1961 .....   | 98  |
| <i>Griswold v Connecticut</i> , U.S. Supreme Court, 1965.....  | 101 |
| <i>Loving v. Virginia</i> , U.S. Supreme Court, 1967.....  | 104 |
| <i>Roe v Wade</i> , U.S. Supreme Court, 1973.....  | 106 |
| <i>Gratz v Bollinger et al.</i> , U.S. Supreme Court, 2003.....                                      | 111 |
| Ideas & Trends: Legal License; Race, Sex and Forbidden Unions,<br>New York Times Article, 2003 ..... | 114 |
| Slate: "Sodomy Flaw" .....   | 116 |
| Slate: "The Supreme Court Tries Sodomy" .....  | 119 |
| <i>Lawrence v. Texas</i> , U.S. Supreme Court, 2003 .....  | 123 |
| New York Times, "The Supreme Ct Paved Way for Marriage Ruling<br>with Sodomy Decision".....          | 136 |
| Washington Post, "What Gay Studies Taught the Court" .....   | 138 |
| Time Magazine, "Should Incest be Legal?" .....   | 142 |
| New York Times: Judicial Intent: The Competing Visions of the Role<br>of the Court" .....            | 143 |
| Slate, "Die Hardest" .....   | 145 |

##### House of Lords:

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <i>Ghaidan v. Mendoza</i> , House of Lords, 2004 .....                          | 148 |
| <i>R. v Headteacher and Denbigh High School (Begum)</i> House of Lords, 2006 .. | 153 |

##### Supreme Court of Canada:

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Weinrib, The SCC and the Implied Bill of Rights..... | 161 |
|--|-----|

##### Supreme Court of Israel:

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <i>Alice Miller v. Minister of Defence</i> , 1995 ..... | 169 |
|---|-----|

#### **E. NEW CONSTITUTIONS: REMEDIAL, TRANSFORMATIVE, & . HUMAN RIGHTS-BASED**

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Donald Kommers and John Finn, "Judicial Review in Comparative Perspective"... | 181 |
|---|-----|

##### German Constitutional Court:

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <i>The Microcensus Case</i> , German Constitutional Court, 1969 .....       | 185 |
| <i>The Life Imprisonment Case</i> , German Constitutional Court, 1977 ..... | 187 |
| <i>S v. Makwanyane</i> , Constitutional Court (South Africa), 1995 .....    | 191 |
| <i>Minister of Home Affairs v Fisher</i> , Privy Council, 1979 .....        | 206 |



## F. LIMITATION ON RIGHTS

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| J. Rawls, <i>Political Liberalism</i> extract .....  | 210 |
| Fred Berger, "Some Aspects of Legal Reasoning Concerning Constitutional Protected Rights" (U.S.) .....   | 213 |
| L. Henkin et al, "Adjudicating Accommodation Between Rights and Public Interests" .....  | 217 |
| Weinrib, "Canada's Charter of Rights: Paradigm Lost?" .....  | 219 |
| The Siracusa Principles on the Limitation and Derogation Provisions in the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights – Limitation ..... | 230 |
| P.P. Craig, "Proportionality", <i>Administrative Law</i> 1999 at 590 .....   | 233 |
| Gerhard Robbers, "Fundamental Rights – General Principles" (Germany) .....   | 234 |
| Helen Mountfield, "The Concept of a Lawful Interference with Fundamental Rights" (U.K.) .....  | 239 |
| Hickman, "Proportionality: Comparative Law Lessons" .....  | 248 |

## G. LEGISLATIVE OVERRIDE

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Canadian Charter s. 33 and Political Documents marking its origin .....             | 273 |
| Weinrib, "The Notwithstanding Clause: the Loophole Cementing the Charter" .....     | 275 |
| Lorraine E. Weinrib "The Canadian Constitution in the Age of Rights", extract ..... | 282 |
| Open Letter to Stephen Harper #1 from Canadian Law Professors .....                 | 289 |
| Open Letter to Stephen Harper #2 from Canadian Law Professors .....                 | 290 |
| Editorial: "Mr. Harper Discards the Override Clause", <i>Globe &amp; Mail</i> ..... | 292 |
| Stephanopoulos, "The Case for the Legislative Override" .....                       | 293 |

## H. EMERGENCY

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <i>Korematsu v United States</i> , U.S. Supreme Court, 1944 .....  | 315 |
| International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Article 49 .....   | 319 |
| The Siracusa Principles on the Limitation and Derogation Provisions in the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights—Derogation ..... | 320 |
| Andras Jakab, German Con Law and Doctrine on State of Emergency .....  | 324 |
| " <i>The Bellmarsh Case</i> ", House of Lords, 2005 .....  | 342 |
| Levinson, "Torture in Iraq & the rule of law in America" .....   | 367 |
| Minow, "The Constitution as Black Box during National Emergencies" .....   | 372 |
| Slate, "It was the Best of Habeas, It was the Worst of Habeas" .....   | 380 |
| Ze'ev Segal, An emergency situation without an emergency" .....  | 384 |

## I. AMENDMENT AND NON-AMENDMENT

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| David A. Strauss, "The Irrelevance of Constitutional Amendments" .....           | 386 |
| Gerard Hogan & Gerry Whyte, "Immutability of Aspects of the Constitution?" ..... | 392 |
| Gunter Durig, "Admissible and Inadmissible Amendments..." (Germany) .....        | 395 |
| Richard Stith, "Unconstitutional Constitutional Amendments" (Nepal) .....        | 396 |
| Zwart, "Judicial Activism in India" (2003) 30 <i>J. Law &amp; Society</i> .....  | 399 |
| Kelbley, Rawls on Unconstituional constitutional amendments .....                | 405 |
| <i>Romer v. Evans</i> , U.S. Supreme Court 1996 .....                            | 419 |